

Creed, Cult and Culture

Good Afternoon, I am Fr. Ryan, the Rector of the Anglican Church of St. Dunstan in St. Louis Park, MN.

Let us pray

O GOD, the Father of our Lord Jesus Christ, our only Saviour, the Prince of Peace; Give us grace seriously to lay to heart the great dangers we are in by our unhappy divisions. Take away all hatred and prejudice, and whatsoever else may hinder us from godly, union and concord: that as there is but one Body and one Spirit, and one hope of our calling, one Lord, one Faith, one Baptism, one God and Father of us all, so we may be all of one heart and of one soul, united in one holy bond of truth and peace, of faith and charity, and may with one mind and one mouth glorify thee; through Jesus Christ our Lord. **AMEN**

The Prayer for Christian Unity - BCP 1928 p. 37

Personal remarks - I want to make clear that I am not an expert on the Catechism of the Catholic Church. For a couple of years I worked for the Roman Catholic Bishop of La Crosse, Wisconsin. At that time the Catechism was promulgated. I directed the office for Adult Catechesis Adult Religious Education.

Working in the Roman Church I was familiar with the Catechism and also how the Roman Catholic Church views the Compendium Catechisms. And so following the Portsmouth Meeting it became clear to me some type of catechetical materials would be necessary for the Anglican Church to be able to compare the Systematic Theology of the two churches on a very basic level. Further, I recognized that if our theology was compatible or identical was only one of the questions that were raised by considering Sacramental Unity with the Roman See.

Explain androgyny and pedagogy and ask for questions and interruptions.

As part of the documentation witnessing to the unity of these two catholic churches, our Bishops signed the Catechism of the Catholic Church. I understand that this action was to be a sign of unity and to reinforce an old Anglican tradition. That tradition being the understanding that we have no theology unique to the Anglican Church rather we share the theology of the Church Catholic.¹

By Church Catholic, I am referring to the Catholic Church as suggested by Avery Dulles, S.J. in his work Catholicity of the Church. In that work the Cardinal identifies the shared theology of all those churches which profess the Bible as the Word of God, The Creeds and the Ecumenical Councils of the church. This says Dulles is the Church Catholic.

In the history of the Anglican Roman Catholic Dialogue we remember the Archbishop of Canterbury, Gregory Fisher (1945 - 1961). It was he who said, "...we have no doctrine of own. We only possess the Catholic doctrine of the Catholic Church, enshrined in the Catholic Creeds, and those creeds we hold without addition or diminution"

And so after contacting Bp. Strawn and with the permission of Bishop Langberg, and Archbishop Hepworth, I began a process of comparing the Catechism of the Catholics Church and the Catechism of 1928 Book of Common Prayer.

As I began to think about how a caparison of the doctrine of the two churches might be constructed, I realized that we had catechisms to compare, but we had profound differences in what we understood the catechisms to be. In the Roman Rite the comprehensive catechisms are the repository of the theology of

¹ The terminology Church Catholic does not directly refer to the Roman Catholic Church, but rather refers to those churches which share in the Apostolic Teaching codified in the First Seven Ecumenical Councils of the Church

the church. In the Anglican Rite we understand our theology to be contained in the Book of Common Prayer and the Holy Bible.

Both churches ascribe to the theological principle of *Lex Orandi, Lex Credendi*. The Latin translates the law of prayer is the law of belief. And so for any comparison to be valid we will need to examine how the liturgy of the church reflects the beliefs professed in the doctrine.

We have different understandings of worship, the nature of that worship and the reason for personal involvement during the worship experience.

(In my parish for instance, we do not refer to Holy Days of Obligation rather we speak of Holy Days of strong suggestion. In my experience, Anglicans generally do not understand attendance from obligation)

Finally, I began to make notes about what questions needed to be addressed as the two churches entered into full Sacred Communion. There are questions concerning ecclesiology, that is how is the church governed. An example is the involvement of the laity in the Anglican Church. We understand that when the church gathers in council, all the members of the church are represented, the laity and those in Holy Orders.

There are questions about Canon Law, Canon Law being the law of the church. Certainly there are differences not only in select sections of Roman and Anglican Canon Law, but there is a difference in structure and intent in the two forms.

And so the scope of any comparison would need to be limited and certain aspects or questions would need to be left for another day if I was to produce anything that might be of value to the church.

I would also draw your attention before we begin to the very basic question of Christian Unity. It is only as the Apostle Paul taught, that is in the Kerygma of faith, that real unity in Christ is found.

On that basic level Paul taught and preached Christ and Him Crucified. What has been part of Christian Liturgy since the beginning and was later codified in the Creeds. Namely that God was Incarnate, lived a human life, was example and sacrifice for us, rose from the dead and will come again to judge the world with His Truth.

I suggest to you that we find unity in the Kerygma of Faith. It is when we expand further that the separation begins to be evident. The moving outward from the Kerygma is the embracing of what some would say are fuller and more complete explanations or understanding of Sacred Scripture. And it is precisely these same complete explanations and the traditions of the individual churches which separate and divide us.

With this understanding let us begin to examine a method by which we can explore the similarity of our faith as proclaimed by St. Paul in his letter to the Ephesians:

⁴There is one body and one Spirit, just as you were called to the one hope that belongs to your call, ⁵one Lord, one faith, one baptism, ⁶one God and Father of us all

Ephesians 4:4-6a

During Lent this year, many of the adult members of my parish gathered to study the materials gathered in a booklet which became, Faith of Our Fathers. This booklet was made available to the entire church and has been used for teaching and study in other parishes. It will be impossible to cover all of the material in the book in the next hour and half and so what I propose that we do is consider a method of organizing our thinking about the two churches and the belief they profess in God, the Father, Son and Holy Ghost.

This workshop is titled "Creed, Cult and Culture". This terminology comes from the discipline of Anthropology. When examining human organizations it is often helpful to use this structure to differentiate the interactions, activities and beliefs of

a group of people and to understand their relative importance to the entire group.

As we begin it is important to have a shared understanding of this terminology. A creed is a statement of belief, usually religious belief. The word derives from the Latin *credo* for I believe.

The literal and traditional meaning of the word cult, is from the Latin *cultus*, meaning "care" or "adoration", it is "a system of religious belief or ritual. In our time cult has taken on a negative connotation, but in formal use, the word "cult" is a neutral term, and refers mainly to divisions within a single faith. And so, Catholic, Eastern Orthodox and Protestant are cults within Christianity.

The word culture comes from the Latin root *colere*, to inhabit, cultivate, or honor. In general it refers to human activity; different definitions of culture reflect different theories for understanding, or criteria for valuing, human activity.

It is important for our discussion that we remember that culture refers to a particular civilization, at a particular stage and reflects the tastes in art and manners that are favored by the predominant social group. Culture consists of the knowledge and values shared by a society.

What I propose is that we first consider the nature of these categories and then consider how they may be applied to the religious beliefs of both Anglican Catholics and Roman Catholics as they are codified in the Catechisms. We will quickly realize that these categories demonstrate not only the shared credal beliefs, but the cultural and cultic differences.

In our discussion we will find that moving from Creed to Cult to Culture we will be moving from the most clear and common understanding of Christian Faith, the Kerygma to the most diverse practices of religion that while still professing the Kerygma are sometimes not even recognizable as reflecting Christian Faith to those outside the particular group.

An example of this might be the May Crowning of the Blessed Mother in the Roman Catholic Tradition or the importance of coffee hour in the Anglican Tradition as our agape meal continues following the Holy Eucharist.

One last task before we begin. The Catechism of the Catholic Church is a comprehension compendium catechism. The Catechism found in the 1928 Book of Common Prayer is teaching catechism. So while we can compare statements in both these documents we should not dismiss the Teaching Catechism as superficial, nor be overwhelmed by the density of the Compendium Catechism.

The Catechism of the Catholic Church published in 1992, is not the first compendium catechism to be promulgated by the Roman See. The Catechism of the Council of Trent was published in 1566. This Catechism was in response to the Council of Trent and like the current Catechism was to be a complete profession of the faith held by the Roman Catholic Church at a particular time. Both these catechisms were written for the clergy and others who taught the faith. They are not designed to be used as direct catechetical tools used in teaching the laity.

The Baltimore Catechism is a teaching catechism derived from the Catechism of the Council of Trent. As with the Catechism of the Council of Trent there are many teaching catechisms that have been and are being developed for the Catechism of the Catholic Church.

The Trent Catechism was promulgated as a response to that council called to address the issues of the Protestant Reformation. The current catechism was promulgated to address the response to Vatican II. And catechisms are not limited to the Catholic Churches. The writings of Calvin and Luther both led to the development of both compendium and teaching catechisms.

The teaching catechism of the 1928 Book of Common Prayer is both used in preparing candidates for the Sacrament of

Confirmation and is connected to the celebration of the Offices of Instructions. Other materials for both preparing candidates for Confirmation and Reception have been written over the years. In addition, the preparation of a Catechumen (One who begins with no knowledge of the Christian Faith) requires other and more complete explanations of the Christian Faith than the catechism can provide.

What we see in the Roman Church is a process of simplification of the compendium catechism and in the Anglican Church a process of supplementing the teaching catechism with additional materials.

Credal Beliefs:

Let us also be clear about what creeds we are talking about and how we can or can not compare the creeds used in common worship. When we speak of creed as applied to this topic we are referring to the creeds which were codified during the first seven Ecumenical Councils of the Church. These include the Nicene / Constantinople Creed generally known as the Nicene Creed, the Apostles Creed or the Baptismal Creed, and the Creed of St. Athanasius. ²

The wordings of these creeds have been changed by their use in worship and by political forces both inside the church and outside. When I refer to the creeds I am noting their written form as codified by the councils.

The differences whether we acknowledge the church as "One, Holy Catholic and Apostolic"³ as does the Roman Rite and the Anglican Missal, or as "one Catholic and Apostolic"⁴ as the 1928 Book of Common Prayer, are simply example of the cultic differences between the two churches. The Nicene Creed in the

² The First Seven Ecumenical Councils, Their History and Theology , Leo D. Davis, Michael Glazier, 1990

³ Novo Ordo and the Anglican Missal

⁴ The 1928 Book of Common Prayer

available Greek and the Latin Text is reflected in the English translations.

Certainly, we recognize the historical influences in the 1928 BCP and the role of liturgical reform in the Roman Rite and the changes that have occurred in worship because of those influences. In the New Order of Worship in the Roman Rite we have them beginning the creed "We believe" rather than "I believe."

An example of the cultic differences would be the translation of the Latin text, Et incarnatus est de Spiritu Sancto ex Maria Virgine, et homo factus est. In the 1928 Book of Common Prayer and the Anglican Missal the text is translated, "and was incarnate by the Holy Ghost of the Virgin Mary and was made man."

Here, we as Anglican say, well done and good show. But!

In this portion of the text we have Anglicans using the word Ghost to translate Spiritu and in the new liturgical order the Romans translating de Spiritu Sancto as "by the power of the Holy Spirit."

With these cultic differences in worship we note that, both churches profess to the Kerygma of faith. God's Son, the second person of the Trinity, was incarnate by the third person of the Trinity, the Holy Spirit, and was born into time of the Virgin Mary His mother.

What is important for us to note in this example is that both churches embrace the Kerygma of Faith contained in these creeds and that these differences of expression are not as great as are the similarity of our understanding of our faith in God.

A similar difference may be noted in the numbering of the Ten Commandments. We should note that the Roman Catholic Church numbers the Ten Commandments as does Jewish Tradition. Compared to the Anglican order the Roman Church unifies the first two commandments and separates into two the last Commandment.

The Roman Rite Lists:

- I. I am the Lord your God: you shall not have strange gods before me.**
- II. You shall not take the name of the Lord your God in vain**
- III. Remember to keep holy the Lord's Day**
- IV. Honor your father and your mother**
- V. You shall not kill**
- VI. You shall not steal**
- VII. You shall not commit adultery**
- VIII. You shall not bear false witness against your neighbor**
- IX. You shall not covet your neighbor's wife**
- X. You shall not covet your neighbor's goods**

The Anglican Order:

- I. God spake these words, and said: I am the LORD thy God; Thou shalt have none other gods but me.
- II. Thou shalt not make to thyself any graven image, nor the likeness of any thing that is in heaven above, or in the earth beneath, or in the water under the earth; thou shalt not bow down to them, nor worship them:
- III. Thou shalt not take the Name of the Lord thy God in vain;
- IV. Remember that thou keep holy the Sabbath-day.
- V. Honour thy father and thy mother;
- VI. Thou shalt do no murder.
- VII. Thou shalt not commit adultery.
- VIII. Thou shalt not steal.
- IX. Thou shalt not bear false witness against thy neighbor.
- X. Thou shalt not covet

The Anglican list reflects the ordering and revision of the Continental Reformation and is shared with churches of the Reformation. We can see the cultural influence of the Continental Reformation on the cultic practice of worship in the Anglican Church.

Deuteronomy 5:7-21

7“You shall have no other gods before me.

8“You shall not make for yourself a graven image, or any likeness of anything that is in heaven above, or that is on the earth beneath, or that is in the water under the earth; 9you shall not bow down to them or serve them; for I the LORD your God am a jealous God, visiting the iniquity of the fathers upon the children to the third and fourth generation of those who hate me, 10but showing steadfast love to thousands of those who love me and keep my commandments.

11“You shall not take the name of the LORD your God in vain: for the LORD will not hold him guiltless who takes his name in vain.

12“Observe the sabbath day, to keep it holy, as the LORD your God commanded you. 13Six days you shall labor, and do all your work; 14but the seventh day is a sabbath to the LORD your God; in it you shall not do any work, you, or your son, or your daughter, or your manservant, or your maidservant, or your ox, or your ass, or any of your cattle, or the sojourner who is within your gates, that your manservant and your maidservant may rest as well as you. 15You shall remember that you were a servant in the land of Egypt, and the LORD your God brought you out thence with a mighty hand and an outstretched arm; therefore the LORD your God commanded you to keep the sabbath day.

16“Honor your father and your mother, as the LORD your God commanded you; that your days may be prolonged, and that it

may go well with you, in the land which the LORD your God gives you.

¹⁷“You shall not kill.

¹⁸“Neither shall you commit adultery.

¹⁹“Neither shall you steal.

²⁰“Neither shall you bear false witness against your neighbor.

²¹“Neither shall you covet your neighbor’s wife; and you shall not desire your neighbor’s house, his field, or his manservant, or his maidservant, his ox, or his ass, or anything that is your neighbor’s.’

Exodus 20

¹And God spoke all these words, saying,

²“I am the LORD your God, who brought you out of the land of Egypt, out of the house of bondage.

³“You shall have no other gods before me.

⁴“You shall not make for yourself a graven image, or any likeness of anything that is in heaven above, or that is in the earth beneath, or that is in the water under the earth; ⁵you shall not bow down to them or serve them; for I the LORD your God am a jealous God, visiting the iniquity of the fathers upon the children to the third and the fourth generation of those who hate me, ⁶but showing steadfast love to thousands of those who love me and keep my commandments.

⁷“You shall not take the name of the LORD your God in vain; for the LORD will not hold him guiltless who takes his name in vain.

⁸“Remember the sabbath day, to keep it holy. ⁹Six days you shall labor, and do all your work; ¹⁰but the seventh day is a sabbath to the LORD your God; in it you shall not do any work, you, or your son, or your daughter, your manservant, or your maidservant, or your cattle, or the sojourner who is within your gates; ¹¹for in six days the LORD made heaven and earth, the sea,

and all that is in them, and rested the seventh day; therefore the LORD blessed the sabbath day and hallowed it.

¹²“Honor your father and your mother, that your days may be long in the land which the LORD your God gives you.

¹³“You shall not kill.

¹⁴“You shall not commit adultery.

¹⁵“You shall not steal.

¹⁶“You shall not bear false witness against your neighbor.

¹⁷“You shall not covet your neighbor’s house; you shall not covet your neighbor’s wife, or his manservant, or his maidservant, or his ox, or his ass, or anything that is your neighbor’s.”

While this is an interesting note of history, the real question is, what do we understand the Commandments to mean and how do they influence our behavior as Christians? We find that both churches share the understanding of what the Ten Commandments mean and how they should affect human behavior. We have cultic and cultural differences, but unity in the Credal Belief.

Beginning the practical work, let me use three examples of how this process of thinking can be applied to your study of the two catechisms. First, let us examine a direct comparison of credal beliefs where the two catechisms both address an issue directly.

On page two of your handout you have the following information on Baptism:

This is the form used in Faith of our Fathers. That is the 1928 Book of Common Prayer Catechism is presented and then in different type the Catechism of the Catholic Church.

From the 1928 Book of Common Prayer Page 577

Question What is your Name?

Answer N. or N. N.

Question Who gave you this Name

Answer. My Sponsors in Baptism; wherein I was made a member of Christ, the child of God, and an inheritor of the kingdom of heaven.

The Following is from the Catechism of the Catholic Church. (Note the change in type face) The numbers refer to the paragraphs as numbered in the Catechism.

2156

The sacrament of Baptism is conferred "in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit." In Baptism, the Lord's name sanctifies man, and the Christian receives his name in the Church. This can be the name of a saint, that is, of a disciple who has lived a life of exemplary fidelity to the Lord. The patron saint provides a model of charity; we are assured of his intercession. The "baptismal name" can also express a Christian mystery or Christian virtue. "Parents, sponsors, and the pastor are to see that a name is not given which is foreign to Christian sentiment."

Answers the question who gave you this name

2157

The Christian begins his day, his prayers, and his activities with the Sign of the Cross: "in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit. Amen." The baptized person dedicates the day to the glory of God and calls on the Savior's grace which lets him act in the Spirit as a child of the Father. The sign of the cross strengthens us in temptations and difficulties.

Making us a child of God

2158

God calls each one by name. Everyone's name is sacred. The name is the icon of the person. It demands respect as a sign of the dignity of the one who bears it.

Calls us into new life

2159

The name one receives is a name for eternity. In the kingdom, the mysterious and unique character of each person marked with God's name will shine forth in splendor. "To him who conquers . . . I will give a white stone, with a new name written on the stone which no one knows except him who receives it." "Then I looked, and Lo, on Mount Zion stood the Lamb, and with him a hundred and forty-four thousand who had his name and his Father's name written on their foreheads."

Calls us into eternal life

In this first comparison we see the nature of the unity of our common faith and the differences of expression. The Anglican Catechism is simple and fulfills its role as a tool to educate for Confirmation. The Roman Catholic Catechism is a more comprehensive statement of the faith of the church. We would be remiss if we did not note the two catechisms give the same answer to the first question.

The Second type of comparison is when one of the catechisms does not address in the same way an issue as defined by the other. An example of this also occurs in the section on Baptism. Our catechism is specific in the second question concerning the promises made by Godparents at Baptism. In the Roman Catechism the answers are the same, but found in many different places and not as a direct answer to this question.

I would direct your attention to page 3 of the handout and continuing on page four.

In this case the Catechism is compared to the Liturgical Celebration. I would remind you that we have previously noted that both of these churches accept the fact that the law of prayer is the law of belief. This makes a comparison of the catechism to the worship service valid. While we note the cultic differences in the Roman Ritual, we find the same answers as the Sacrament is celebrated.

From the 1928 Book of Common Prayer Page 577

Question What did your Sponsors then promise for you?

Answer They did promise and vow three things in my name: First, that I should renounce the devil and all his works, the pomps and vanity of this wicked world, and all the sinful lusts of the flesh; Secondly, that I should believe all the Articles of the Christian Faith; And Thirdly, that I should keep God's holy will and commandments, and walk in the same all the days of my life.

The Roman Rite:⁵

<i>Celebrant:</i>	<i>Do you reject Satan?</i>	#1
<i>Parents and Godparent:</i>	<i>I do</i>	
<i>Celebrant:</i>	<i>And all his works</i>	#1
<i>P/G:</i>	<i>I do</i>	
<i>Celebrant:</i>	<i>And all his empty promises?</i>	#1
<i>P/G:</i>	<i>I do</i>	
<i>Celebrant:</i>	<i>Do you believe in God, the Father almighty, creator of heaven and earth?</i>	
<i>P/G:</i>	<i>I do</i>	#2
<i>Celebrant:</i>	<i>Do you believe in Jesus Christ, his only Son, our Lord, who was born of the Virgin Mary, was crucified, died and was buried, rose from the dead, and is now seated at the right hand of the Father?</i>	
<i>P/G:</i>	<i>I do</i>	#2
<i>Celebrant:</i>	<i>Do you believe in the Holy Spirit, the holy catholic Church, the communion of saints, the forgiveness of sins, the resurrection of the body, and life everlasting</i>	
<i>P/G:</i>	<i>I do</i>	#2
<i>Celebrant:</i>	<i>This is our faith. This is the faith of the Church. We are proud to profess it, in Christ Jesus our Lord</i>	
<i>All:</i>	<i>Amen</i>	
<i>Celebrant:</i>	<i>Is it your will that N. should be baptized in the faith of the church, which we have professed with you</i>	
<i>P/G:</i>	<i>It is</i>	

The Rite of Baptism printed above duplicated the first two answers given in the catechism, renunciation of evil and the profession of faith as contain in the Apostles Creed.

The **third promise** is echoed in this paragraph from the Roman Catechism.

⁵ From the Rites of the Roman Catholic Church Volume I, copyright 1990 Pueblo, ISBN 0-916134-15-6 P. 385

2340

Whoever wants to remain faithful to his baptismal promises and resist temptations will want to adopt the means for doing so: self-knowledge, practice of an ascesis adapted to the situations that confront him, obedience to God's commandments, exercise of the moral virtues, and fidelity to prayer. "Indeed it is through chastity that we are gathered together and led back to the unity from which we were fragmented into multiplicity."

This paragraph (2340) refers to the ongoing work of living out the promises made at Baptism. It is the duty of our parents, Godparents and the church to instruct us by word and example so we may strive to be faithful all the days of our life.

Note Handout pages: 4/5

Continuing on page 4 and including page 5 you will see the reverse of the situation concerning the two churches. While the Roman Church answers the question of numbering the Sacraments, in a simple and direct way. It is the Anglican Church that offers one answer in the catechism and then completes the answer in the Ritual Practice of the church.

From the 1928 Book of Common Prayer Page 581

Question How many Sacraments hath Christ ordained in his Church?
 Answer Two only, as generally necessary to salvation; that is to say, Baptism, and the Supper of the Lord.

It is important for us to note that the Roman Catholic Catechism recognizes the seven Sacraments. The Anglican Tradition speaks of the two Dominical Sacraments (Those Sacraments directly commanded by Jesus) as necessary for Salvation. However the Book of Common Prayer 1928 contains the means and direction for celebrating all seven Sacraments of the Church Catholic.

<i>Holy Eucharist</i>	- BCP 67
<i>Confirmation</i>	- BCP 296
<i>Reconciliation/Penance</i>	- Numerous references in other celebrations from the Morning Prayer to the General Confession during Holy Communion Specifically BCP 88 refers to confession to a priest
<i>Anointing of the Sick</i>	- BCP 320
<i>Holy Matrimony</i>	- BCP 300
<i>Ordination - Holy Orders</i>	- BCP 529

We learn from this that while the Catechism refers to the two Dominical Sacraments, the practice of the church as found in the Book of Common Prayer celebrates all seven Sacraments.

The Roman Church celebrates Seven Sacraments

1113

The whole liturgical life of the Church revolves around the Eucharistic sacrifice and the sacraments. There are seven sacraments in the Church: Baptism, Confirmation or Chrismation, Eucharist, Penance, Anointing of the Sick, Holy Orders, and Matrimony. This article will discuss what is common to the Church's seven sacraments from a doctrinal point of view. What is common to them in terms of their celebration will be presented in the second chapter, and what is distinctive about each will be the topic of the *Section Two*.

The Roman Catechism continues its explanation by noting the centrality of what the Anglican Church notes as the Dominical Sacraments

1212

The sacraments of Christian initiation—Baptism, Confirmation, and the Eucharist—lay the foundations of every Christian life.* "The sharing in the divine nature given to men through the grace of Christ bears a certain likeness to the origin, development, and nourishing of natural life. The faithful are born anew by Baptism, strengthened by the sacrament of Confirmation, and receive in the Eucharist the food of eternal life. By means of these sacraments of Christian initiation, they thus receive in increasing measure the treasures of the divine life and advance toward the perfection of charity."

*** Note the place of Confirmation in the role of initiation; we will talk of that in a few moments**

1215

This sacrament is also called "the washing of regeneration and renewal ** by the Holy Spirit," for it signifies and actually brings about the birth of water and the Spirit without which no one "can enter the kingdom of God."

**** This I would note is the language and understanding of the Anglican Church and not the language of the 1979 BCP**

1257

The Lord himself affirms that Baptism is necessary for salvation. He also commands his disciples to proclaim the Gospel to all nations and to baptize them. Baptism is necessary for salvation for those to whom the Gospel has been proclaimed and who have had the possibility of asking for this sacrament. The Church does not know of any means other than Baptism that assures entry into eternal beatitude; this is why she takes care not to neglect the mission she has received from the Lord to see that all who can be baptized are "reborn of water and the Spirit." God has bound salvation to the sacrament of Baptism, but he himself is not bound by his sacraments.

1322

The holy Eucharist completes Christian initiation. Those who have been raised to the dignity of the royal priesthood by Baptism and configured more deeply to Christ by Confirmation participate with the whole community in the Lord's own sacrifice by means of the Eucharist.

Theologically, we agree in the Sacramental nature of our worship, the number of Sacraments we celebrate and method by which we understand sacraments to be effective. That is to say we agree that there is a Scriptural Basis for the Sacraments, an outward sign and an inward Spiritual Grace.

Any differences we realize are about the cultic practice and the cultural nature of the two churches. An example is the different understanding of Confirmation in the two churches. This is culturally influenced, cultic difference. Romans have many different understanding of this Sacrament, but generally understand Confirmation as the end of the Sacrament of Initiation. Their cultural understanding is based upon the ancient teaching that the Bishop as the chief pastor of the diocese needed to make yearly visits to all the churches. This leads them to

explain that Chrismation from a Bishop is necessary for the completion of initiation.

Anglican Theologians vary in their explanation but generally accept the Eastern view that initiation is complete at Baptism and Confirmation is an adult affirmation of Faith. We can suggest that two influences are at work culturally in the Anglican Church; the old Celtic Christian traditions and the Continental Reformation.

So while there is little or no difference in our Biblical/Creedal beliefs in the Sacraments, and very little difference in our cultic celebrations, there are cultural differences. Noting this cultural difference leads us to the final comparison we need to address. Where the cultural and cultic practices of the church are neither in agreement nor supported by either catechism.

Of the Blessed Mother: **See page 6 of the handouts** - In the spirit of this election year now you all get to vote on what we as Anglican's believe concerning the Blessed Virgin Mary

In The Catechism of the Catholic Church we read these passages concerning Mary:

963

Since the Virgin Mary's role in the mystery of Christ and the Spirit has been treated, it is fitting now to consider her place in the mystery of the Church. "The Virgin Mary . . . is acknowledged and honored as being truly the Mother of God and of the redeemer. . . . She is 'clearly the mother of the members of Christ' . . . since she has by her charity joined in bringing about the birth of believers in the Church, who are members of its head." "Mary, Mother of Christ, Mother of the Church."

Agree / Disagree

964

Mary's role in the Church is inseparable from her union with Christ and flows directly from it. "This union of the mother with the Son in the work of salvation is made manifest from the time of Christ's virginal conception up to his death"; it is made manifest above all at the hour of his Passion: Thus the Blessed Virgin advanced in her pilgrimage of faith, and faithfully persevered in her union with her Son unto the cross. There she stood, in keeping with the divine plan, enduring

with her only begotten Son the intensity of his suffering, joining herself with his sacrifice in her mother's heart, and lovingly consenting to the immolation of this victim, born of her: to be given, by the same Christ Jesus dying on the cross, as a mother to his disciple, with these words: "Woman, behold your son."

Agree / Disagree

965

After her Son's Ascension, Mary "aided the beginnings of the Church by her prayers." In her association with the apostles and several women, "we also see Mary by her prayers imploring the gift of the Spirit, who had already overshadowed her in the Annunciation."

Agree / Disagree - This is trick one

¹²Then they returned to Jerusalem from the mount called Olivet, which is near Jerusalem, a sabbath day's journey away; ¹³and when they had entered, they went up to the upper room, where they were staying, Peter and John and James and Andrew, Philip and Thomas, Bartholomew and Matthew, James the son of Alphaeus and Simon the Zealot and Judas the son of James. ¹⁴All these with one accord devoted themselves to prayer, together with the women and Mary the mother of Jesus, and with his brothers.

Acts 1:12-14

969

"This motherhood of Mary in the order of grace continues uninterruptedly from the consent which she loyally gave at the Annunciation and which she sustained without wavering beneath the cross, until the eternal fulfilment of all the elect. Taken up to heaven she did not lay aside this saving office but by her manifold intercession continues to bring us the gifts of eternal salvation. . . . Therefore the Blessed Virgin is invoked in the Church under the titles of Advocate, Helper, Benefactress, and Mediatrix."

Agree / Disagree - Another tricky One

¹And a great portent appeared in heaven, a woman clothed with the sun, with the moon under her feet, and on her head a crown of twelve stars; ²she was with child and she cried out in her pangs of birth, in anguish for delivery. ³And another portent appeared in heaven; behold, a great red dragon, with seven heads and ten horns, and seven diadems upon his heads. ⁴His tail swept down a third of the stars of heaven, and cast them to the earth. And the dragon stood before the woman who was about to bear a child, that he might devour her child when she brought it forth; ⁵she brought forth a male child, one who is to rule all the nations with a rod of iron, but her child was caught up to God and to his throne,

Revelation
12:1-

We are going to skip 970 for now, but we will come back to it in a minute

970

"Mary's function as mother of men in no way obscures or diminishes this unique mediation of Christ, but rather shows its power. But the Blessed Virgin's salutary influence on men . . . flows forth from the superabundance of the merits of Christ, rests on his mediation, depends entirely on it, and draws all its power from it."
"No creature could ever be counted along with the Incarnate Word and Redeemer; but just as the priesthood of Christ is shared in various ways both by his ministers and the faithful, and as the one goodness of God is radiated in different ways among his creatures, so also the unique mediation of the Redeemer does not exclude but rather gives rise to a manifold cooperation which is but a sharing in this one source."

971

"All generations will call me blessed": "The Church's devotion to the Blessed Virgin is intrinsic to Christian worship." The Church rightly honors "the Blessed Virgin with special devotion. From the most ancient times the Blessed Virgin has been honored with the title of 'Mother of God,' to whose protection the faithful fly in all their dangers and needs. . . . This very special devotion . . . differs essentially from the adoration which is given to the incarnate Word and equally to the Father and the Holy Spirit, and greatly fosters this adoration." The liturgical feasts dedicated to the Mother of God and Marian prayer, such as the rosary, an "epitome of the whole Gospel," express this devotion to the Virgin Mary.

Agree / Disagree - Consider the place of the Magnificate in Evening Prayer

973

By pronouncing her "fiat" at the Annunciation and giving her consent to the Incarnation, Mary was already collaborating with the whole work her Son was to accomplish. She is mother wherever he is Savior and head of the Mystical Body.

Agree / Disagree

Is this not the proclamation of Mary as the archetype of the Christian Disciple - Saying yes to God

975

"We believe that the Holy Mother of God, the new Eve, Mother of the Church, continues in heaven to exercise her maternal role on behalf of the members of Christ" (Paul VI, CPG § 15).

Agree / Disagree - Titles for Mary - See Revelation

Let us examine what is taught about the Blessed Virgin Mary. In the catechism found in the Book of Common Prayer 1928 the only the reference to the Blessed Mother is in the Apostles Creed. In the Catechism of the Catholic Church a great deal is said about the Blessed Mother, but what is the core teaching?

Let me draw your attention to number 970 on page 6.

970

"Mary's function as mother of men in no way obscures or diminishes this unique mediation of Christ, but rather shows its power. But the Blessed Virgin's salutary influence on men . . . flows forth from the superabundance of the merits of Christ, rests on his mediation, depends entirely on it, and draws all its power from it. No creature could ever be counted along with the Incarnate Word and Redeemer; but just as the priesthood of Christ is shared in various ways both by his ministers and the faithful,

and as the one goodness of God is radiated in different ways among his creatures, so also the unique mediation of the Redeemer does not exclude but rather gives rise to a manifold cooperation which is but a sharing in this one source."

As I read this passage from the Catechism I am reminded of the words of the Anglican, Bishop Hall "all honor is due the Mother of the Lord, all honor short of divinity"

The brevity of the Bishop's statement should be understood as no less profound than the multiplicity of words in the Catechism of the Catholic Church. While the Roman Catholic Church honors in a more formal way the Motherhood of Mary, we may ask if the informal cultic practices and the extra liturgical cultural worship are in fact supported by theology expressed in the Catechism of the Catholic Church.

What I mean is simply this. If you ask 100 Roman Catholics if they pray to the Blessed Mother, I believe most would say yes. However, the Catechism teaches them that what they are to do is seek the intercession of Mary and the Saints so that they might pray with them, through Christ, in the power of the Holy Spirit, to God the Father.

While the cultural practices of some Roman Catholics have at some times in some places far exceeded the teaching of the Holy Bible and the Roman Catholic Church (The Magisterium), honoring the Mother of our Lord and remembering her role in Salvation History is something Anglican, Orthodox and Roman Catholics agree upon.

The Book of Common Prayer 1928 does not contain prayers addressed to or for the intercession of Mary, the Mother of God. The Hail Mary and other devotional prayers are not found in our prayer book, but they are found in the commonly used Anglican Devotional Books and Religious Manuals of the Anglican

Tradition.⁶ (The Practice of Religion, St. Augustine's Prayer Book, and A Manual for Priests are examples) And while there would not seem to be clear understanding of our devotion to the Blessed Mother, her role in Salvation History is clearly remembered by the Anglican Church.

The Calendar found in the 1928 Book of Common Prayer, includes the Feast of the Annunciation and with our understanding the primacy of Sacred Scripture, Mary's actions are read and preached upon. In the Gospels we read the record of Mary's faithfulness and our Daily Evening Prayer includes the recitation of the Magnificate.

What do Anglicans believe about Mary the Mother of the Lord? I suppose that there are as many different answers to that question as there are Anglicans in the world. In the High Church Tradition, Our Lady of Walsingham is honored and her intercession is sought. Many parishes have chapters of the Society of Mary and regularly remember the Marian Feasts.

On the other side, the Low Church Tradition keeps the Church Calendar and reads in Sacred Scripture the record of Mary's role in Salvation History. So we may assume that even the Low Church Anglicans honor the Mother of the Lord.

We rely upon Sacred Scripture as definitive for the Anglican Church Theology when we consider Mary and her role. Many theologians, Bishops and priests have long taught and preached about Mary as the example of discipleship. Her single minded focus and her willingness to trust completely in God's Word are noted in Sacred Scripture. St. Luke 1:26-39

We are aware that the Roman Catholic Church does equally honor Mary as the Mother of our Lord and further preaches and teaches that seeking her intercession is right and proper to do.

⁶ The Practice of Religion, St. Augustine's Prayer Book, and A Manual for Priests are examples

In the Roman Rite individual devotions to the Blessed Mother are encouraged and while the teaching of the church clearly states that prayer is addressed to God, the intercession of the Blessed Mother and other saints may be sought. That is not what the Roman Church culture has come to understand. It is this culture that finds prayer addressed to the Blessed Mother and the saints, not the teachings of the Catechism. The catechism clearly states that what the faithful are to seek are the prayers of those who have died and are now growing in their love and service, as Anglicans do in the Prayer for the Whole State of Christ's Church.⁷

Purgatory, Purgation or Paradise

While the Anglican Catechism in the 1928 Book of Common Prayer and the dialogue of the Office of Instruction does not address the issue of Purgatory or Purgation directly the church nevertheless addresses death and our passage into Glory in our liturgies. The Biblical references are -abundant as to what has been prepared for us and the process we will undergo, but the Lord did not leave us an exact outline.

The Catechism of the Catholic Church founded upon Scripture and the Tradition of the Church, contains a detailed understanding of Roman Catholic Theology. The question to be addressed is whether the theology is comparable to the Anglican Theology found in the Prayer Book and Sacred Scripture.

The concept of the Church as divided into three separate and yet connected experiences comes from many sources in Scripture. From the images described in the Revelation to St. John to the practical wiring in St. Paul's Epistles; it is clear to Church Catholic that the Church Militant, Expectant and Triumphant is how we should understand both the divine structure and the path of our individual journey of faith.

⁷ From the Prayer for the Whole state for Christ Church BCP 1928 page 75

Anglicans and Romans also share a common understanding of the Communion of Saints. This understanding is stated in the Apostles Creed and jointly celebrated on the Feast of All Saints. Both Churches also pray for the dead, not only on the Feast of All Souls, but each time the Holy Eucharist is celebrated.

So what do we agree upon as stated in the Creeds and Celebrated in Liturgy?

There is a church as it exists in this time and place. There is a Church that exists beyond death that is moving into the nearer presence of God and there is the church at the end of time, when all things will be made new. We agree that we pray for our beloved dead and that after their death they continue to grow as Christians in their faith and love of the Lord.

Where do we find these beliefs in the Book of Common Prayer and what does The Catechism of the Catholic Church say about them?

In the Prayer for the Whole State of Christ Church we pray:

BCP 1928 Page 74, 75

"And we also bless thy holy Name for all thy servants departed this life in thy faith and fear; beseeching thee to grant them continual growth in thy love and service, and to give us grace so to follow their good examples, that with them we may be partakers of thy heavenly kingdom. Grant this, O Father, for Jesus Christ's sake, our only Mediator and Advocate.

Amen"

It would seem clear that the Anglican Church is praying for and believes that:

Those who have died to this world, believing in God, will continue to experience a growth in their faith and fear of the Lord. They will continue to serve God and be purified in this service as we are unified with God by our faith and service to others in this place and time.

Further, that we wish to follow them into death and the experience of purification and growth until we will all be in God's Heavenly Kingdom on the last day.

The Catechism of the Catholic Church comments on this process in this way.

Continuing on Page 7 of the Handout

III. The Final Purification, or Purgatory

1030

All who die in God's grace and friendship, but still imperfectly purified, are indeed assured of their eternal salvation; but after death they undergo purification, so as to achieve the holiness necessary to enter the joy of heaven.

1031

The Church gives the name Purgatory to this final purification of the elect, which is entirely different from the punishment of the damned. The Church formulated her doctrine of faith on Purgatory especially at the Councils of Florence and Trent. The tradition of the Church, by reference to certain texts of Scripture, speaks of a cleansing fire: *1 Cor 3:15; 1 Pet 1:7.*

As for certain lesser faults, we must believe that, before the Final Judgment, there is a purifying fire. He who is truth says that whoever utters blasphemy against the Holy Spirit will be pardoned neither in this age nor in the age to come. From this sentence we understand that certain offenses can be forgiven in this age, but certain others in the age to come.⁶⁰⁸

We read in 1030 what we pray in the Prayer for the Whole State of Christ Church. In 1031 we are informed of why the term Purgatory is used by the Roman Catholic Church for this process. Note however, that the explanation does not suggest or explain Purgatory as a place rather than a process.

In the Prayer for the Whole State of Christ Church we are praying for the dead and certainly we pray for the dead on the feasts of All

Saints and All Souls. The Catechism of the Catholic Church explains why this tradition came into the Church.

1032

This teaching is also based on the practice of prayer for the dead, already mentioned in Sacred Scripture: "Therefore [Judas Maccabeus] made atonement for the dead, that they might be delivered from their sin."⁶⁰⁹ From the beginning the Church has honored the memory of the dead and offered prayers in suffrage for them, above all the Eucharistic sacrifice, so that, thus purified, they may attain the beatific vision of God.⁶¹⁰ The Church also commends almsgiving, indulgences, and works of penance undertaken on behalf of the dead:

Let us help and commemorate them. If Job's sons were purified by their father's sacrifice, why would we doubt that our offerings for the dead bring them some consolation? Let us not hesitate to help those who have died and to offer our prayers for them.⁶¹¹

1032 also mentions actions beyond prayer for the dead. Almsgiving, indulgences and works of penance are also noted as methods of aiding the dead as they continue to grow in their love and service. Is there any Anglican theology that would be comparable to this Roman Tradition?

Almsgiving on behalf of the dead is often practiced in Anglicanism and other traditions. Memorials given in the name of the dead are found not only in churches, but in city parks, recreational facilities, hospitals and many other charitable organizations.

The church like other human organizations has the tradition of children following the example of parents in many endeavors of life. Certainly many churches have second or third generations following parent's examples in service to the church or the wider community. Are not these actions, these duties performed to serve others Godly penance for our sins and for the sins of our loved ones?

What about indulgences? Didn't the Anglican Church do away with them when the English Church separated from Rome?

Yes, and No. What do you think is meant by an indulgence?

Following the General Confession the Bishop or priest says:

BCP 76

ALMIGHTY God, our heavenly Father, who of his great mercy hath promised forgiveness of sins to all those who with hearty repentance and true faith turn unto him; Have mercy upon you; pardon and deliver you from all your sins; confirm and strengthen you in all goodness; and bring you to everlasting life; through Jesus Christ our Lord.

Amen.

In The Catechism of the Catholic Church we read:

X. Indulgences

1471

The doctrine and practice of indulgences in the Church are closely linked to the effects of the sacrament of Penance.

What is an indulgence?

"An indulgence is a remission before God of the temporal punishment due to sins whose guilt has already been forgiven, which the faithful Christian who is duly disposed gains under certain prescribed conditions through the action of the Church which, as the minister of redemption, dispenses and applies with authority the treasury of the satisfactions of Christ and the saints."⁸¹

"An indulgence is partial or plenary according as it removes either part or all of the temporal punishment due to sin."⁸² The faithful can gain indulgences for themselves or apply them to the dead.⁸³

And so if we consider the words of absolution pronounced by a minister of God's Grace through the Church and the definition of an indulgence from the Catechism we find that each Sunday as we

celebrate the Holy Eucharist we as Anglicans receive an indulgence for the sins we have committed.

To explain further we must consider what we do when we say the General confession and what we expect happens when we confess our sins either before the Throne of Grace as we kneel with our brothers and sisters in worship or before a priest of the church in a more private setting.

First, we are disposed to make a confession. Second, we are able to understand and evaluate what of our actions are sinful. Finally, we are able to determine the seriousness of the sins we are confessing.

These three prerequisites are enumerated in the call to confession.

BCP 75

YE who do truly and earnestly repent you of your sins, and are in love and charity with your neighbors, and intend to lead a new life, following the commandments of God, and walking from henceforth in his holy ways; Draw near with faith, and take this holy Sacrament to your comfort; and make your humble confession to Almighty God, devoutly kneeling.

The Catechism of the Catholic Church further explains the nature of sins by considering the seriousness of the particular sin. Sins are then classified as either venial or mortal. Anglicans would understand venial sins **as those things we have left undone OR those things which we ought not to have done; those things done with no conscience thought**

We find these statements in The Catechism of the Catholic Church:

1472

To understand this doctrine and practice of the Church, it is necessary to understand that sin has a double consequence. Grave sin deprives us of communion with God and therefore makes us incapable of eternal life, the privation of which is called the "eternal punishment" of sin. On the other hand every sin, even venial, entails an unhealthy attachment to creatures, which must be purified either here on earth, or after death in the state called Purgatory. This purification frees one from what is called the "temporal punishment" of sin. These two punishments must not be conceived of as a kind of vengeance inflicted by God from without, but as following from the very nature of sin. A conversion which proceeds from a fervent charity can attain the complete purification of the sinner in such a way that no punishment would remain.

1473

The forgiveness of sin and restoration of communion with God entail the remission of the eternal punishment of sin, but temporal punishment of sin remains. While patiently bearing sufferings and trials of all kinds and, when the day comes, serenely facing death, the Christian must strive to accept this temporal punishment of sin as a grace. He should strive by works of mercy and charity, as well as by prayer and the various practices of penance, to put off completely the "old man" and to put on the "new man."

Perhaps we can translate all this theology into a practical example of what we mean by sin, forgiveness, and receiving an indulgence. It's Sunday Morning and you pull into the church parking lot. You are putting your car into a parking space and realize you are too close to the next car. You back out and strike another car that has pulled in behind you. It was an accident; you just didn't see the car. You apologize and the other parishioner says you can settle everything after church.

During the General Confession you recall the incident. You are sorry it happened; you did not love your neighbor as your self when you damaged his car. The priest stands and offers God's Absolution for your sins. You receive an indulgence (Your sin is forgiven) for the eternal punishment of not loving your neighbor, but after church you still exchange insurance information or you

offer to pay for the damages. The temporal punishment for hitting the car still exists and you must deal with it. The eternal consequences of the sin have been forgiven. Let us summarize this method of reviewing the Catechism of the Catholic Church and the Catechism and theology of the Anglican Church.

Q/C

It would appear that the culture of a church is shaped by the creed of the church and the cult. The cult of a church is the activities of the church that are defined by both the creeds and the traditions of the church. The culture of the church is further influenced by the local society.

Our conclusion from this discussion might be that the two churches will never be one. And indeed when we consider our human understand of unity we may never experience the One, Holy Catholic and Apostolic Church until the second coming of Christ. But if we consider the unity of the Blessed Trinity, the unity without the confusion of the persons, then there may be a unity of God's Church in this place and time.

The unity we will find will be theological and sacramental. Theological in that we share the same understanding of the nature of God and His relationship with what He has created. Sharing our understanding of the Kerygma of Faith, that Jesus came into the world to be our example and sacrifice for the sin of the world. That following His Sacrifice on the Cross He was raised from the dead and ascended into heaven. And that He will come again to judge the world.

Our unity will be sacramental because of our common understanding of the nature and effectiveness of the Sacraments to convey God's Grace. Mutually we will accept the continuation of the Apostolic Succession in our Holy Orders. This would mean that full intercommunion is realized between the Roman Catholic Church and the churches of the Traditional Anglican Communion.

It will not mean that we share the cultic understandings or the same culture. In those areas we will grow together over time as God Perfect Will for His Church is revealed.

What is the next step? Most importantly we must go forward with the mission of the church. To proclaim the Gospel, celebrate the Sacraments and be about the work of the Salvation of Souls.

As we are engaged in mission we should also begin our own academic study of the Catechism of the Catholic Church. This may be done as individuals or in the parish setting.

This paper and Faith of our Fathers is available on the St. Dunstan's Webpage or may be ordered using the St. Dunstan's Press order form.

My contact information is printed on the last page of your handout.